

Evaluating a Proposal

The great philosopher Socrates was once asked by his student should I marry.

He answered by all means you should marry

If you get a good wife you will be eternally happy

If you get bad wife you will become

A Great Philosopher

If you do a good selection your project will run smoothly, challenges will be worked out, and you too can be happy.

If you do a poor job you too can become a great philosopher.

What you must know to review the proposal

Know the project

Know the RFP

Know your reader. (City Council)

Know the Project

What is the selection for?

What is to be built and where

Permitting

Right of way

Utilities

Maintenance of Traffic challenges

ADA and Pedestrian challenges

Property and business access

School routes

Know the Request for Proposals

What is the selection for

Study

Design

Construction Engineering and Inspection

Scoring Criteria Phase 1

What are the categories and assigned points.

CCNA requires the selection to be based on experience and qualifications only

Typical Categories specific for the project

Awareness of Project Issues

Approach to Project

Staffing, Check the references the firms provide.

Other Considerations

Evaluating the Proposal

Read it carefully

Use a high lighter and red pen to make notes directly on the proposal.

Look at how it's organized, does it follow the scoring criteria, or does it ramble along and make you hunt for pertinent information.

Does it directly address project issues with details of how the consultant will approach them, or does it say we will be proactive with little detail on how.

Use a spreadsheet with the categories on the left side and the Consultant teams on the top.

Reread the proposal and note in the spread sheet the good and bad for each category. When you write the evaluation cut and paste from the spreadsheet.

Evaluating the Proposal

Don't worry for ties on the first pass.

Usually there will be three or four proposals that will rise to the top.

Reread these again and look for details that will set them apart.

Scoring Criteria Phase 2

Based on a predetermined questions decided by the committee and project manager.

If the selection includes a presentation by the firm watch how the consultant project manager handles the questions.

Does the PM answer all the questions himself or fields the question and hands it off to a subject matter expert.

How does he manage the allotted time.

Writing your evaluation

Keep in mind you are writing for the City Council, and the consultant firms may also read it.

The City Council may or may not have read the proposal, and they may not have your knowledge of the project.

Don't compare one firm to another in the written evaluation, the scores you assign will separate them.

Keep it short and to the point use bullet points and make notes such as (*Reviewers note: Comment*) to call out less desirable features that are in the proposal.

Consultants often cut and paste from past proposals, unfortunately they don't always read what they wrote so it may not be applicable to the project.

Everything you write on the score sheet is public record.

Writing your evaluation

Be ready to justify your evaluation and comments to the City Council and possibly the firm.